

## Sampling Analysis using Correlations for Monte Carlo Integration

## Part 2: Error Analysis

Gurprit Singh gsingh@mpi-inf.mpg.de

















 $f(\vec{x})$ 



 $l\vec{x}$  $J_0$ 



 $f(\vec{x})$ 



 $l\vec{x}$ Τ  $\int_0^{J_0} J_0^{(n)}$ 



 $f(\vec{x})$ 



N $N \underset{k=1}{\overset{\frown}{\sum}} p(\vec{x}_k)$ 

# **Error as Noise during Monte Carlo Integration**















Jitter

## Poisson Disk













Jitter

## Poisson Disk











# Variance Convergence Rate of Samplers



Random

## Number of Samples

# Variance Convergence Rate of Samplers



Random 4D Jittered

## Number of Samples

# Variance Convergence Rate of Samplers



Random 4D Jittered Poisson Disk

### Number of Samples



## Overview

- Error Formulation in the Spatial Domain
- Error Formulation in the Fourier Domain
- Practical Results
- Conclusion: Design Principles

## Overview

- Error Formulation in the Spatial Domain
- Error Formulation in the Fourier Domain
- Practical Results
- Conclusion: Design Principles

# True Integral: $I = \int_{0}^{1} f(x) dx$



Monte Carlo Estimation:  $\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=1}^{N} \frac{f(x_k)}{p(x_k)}$ 

$$\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k)$$



Over multiple realizations:

## $Error = Bias^2 + Variance$

 $I = \int_0^1 f(x) dx$ 



$$\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k)$$



Over multiple realizations:

Bias:

 $I = \int_0^1 f(x) dx$ 

- $\text{Error} = \text{Bias}^2 + \text{Variance}$
- $\mathbb{E}[\Delta] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I} I] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}] I$



$$\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k)$$



Over multiple realizations:

Bias:  $\mathbb{E}[\Delta]$   $I = \int_0^1 f(x) dx$ 

 $Error = Bias^2 + Variance$ 

 $= \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}] - I$ 



$$\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k)$$



Over multiple realizations:

Bias:  $\mathbb{E}[\Delta] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}] - I$ 

Variance:  $Var[\hat{I}] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] - \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^2$ 

 $I = \int_0^1 f(x) dx$ 

- $Error = Bias^2 + Variance$



## **Error: Bias and Variance**

 $\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k)$ k=1

## Bias: $\mathbb{E}[\Delta] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}] - I$

 $\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}] = ?$ 

 $I = \int_0^1 f(x) dx$ 

## Variance: $Var[\hat{I}] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] - \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^2$



# **Campbell's Theorem**

 $\mathbb{E}\left[\sum_{k=1}^{N} f(x_k)\right] = \int_{\mathbb{R}^d} f(x)\lambda(x)dx$ 



# **Campbell's Theorem**

 $\mathbb{E}\left[\sum_{k=1}^{N} f(x_k)\right] = \int_{\mathbb{R}^d} f(x)\lambda(x)dx$ 

### $\lambda(x)$ First order product density



$$\mathbb{E}\left[\sum_{j,k} f(x_j, x_k)\right] = \int_{\mathbb{R}^d \times \mathbb{R}^d} f(x) f(y) \varrho(x, y) dx$$



# **Campbell's Theorem**

 $\mathbb{E}\left[\sum_{k=1}^{N} f(x_k)\right] = \int_{\mathbb{R}^d} f(x)\lambda(x)dx$ 

### $\lambda(x)$ First order product density



$$\mathbb{E}\left[\sum_{j,k} f(x_j, x_k)\right] = \int_{\mathbb{R}^d \times \mathbb{R}^d} f(x) f(y) \varrho(x, y) dx$$

$$\varrho(x,y)$$

Second order product density

Expected number of points around x & y

Measures the joint probability p(x, y)





# **Error: Bias and Variance** Bias: $\mathbb{E}[\Delta] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}] - I$

$$\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k)$$

## Variance: $Var[\hat{I}] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] - \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^2$

# **Error: Bias Term** Bias: $\mathbb{E}[\Delta] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}] - I$

$$\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k)$$







$$\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}] = \mathbb{E}\left[\sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k)\right] = \int_{V} w(x).$$

## $f(x)\lambda(x)dx$

## Using Campbell's Theorem



 $\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}] = \int_{V} w(x) f(x) \lambda(x) dx$ 

## **Error: Bias Term**

Bias: 
$$\mathbb{E}[\Delta] = \int_{V} w(x) f(x) \lambda(x) dx - w(x) = 1/\lambda(x) \longrightarrow \mathbb{E}[\Delta] = 0$$

Bias goes to zero

34

Ι

## **Error: Bias Term**

Bias: 
$$\mathbb{E}[\Delta] = \int_{V} w(x) f(x) \lambda(x) dx - w(x) = 1/\lambda(x) \longrightarrow \mathbb{E}[\Delta] = 0$$

Bias goes to zero

For fixed sample count N

$$\lambda(x) = Np(x)$$

$$\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=1}^{N} \frac{f(x_k)}{p(x_k)}$$

Ι



## **Error: Bias Term**

Bias: 
$$\mathbb{E}[\Delta] = \int_{V} w(x) f(x) \lambda(x) dx - w(x) = 1/\lambda(x) \longrightarrow \mathbb{E}[\Delta] = 0$$

Bias goes to zero

For fixed sample count N

$$\lambda(x) = Np(x)$$

$$\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=1}^{N} \frac{f(x_k)}{p(x_k)}$$

Ι


#### **Error: Bias Term**

Bias: 
$$\mathbb{E}[\Delta] = \int_{V} w(x) f(x) \lambda(x) dx - w(x) = 1/\lambda(x) \longrightarrow \mathbb{E}[\Delta] = 0$$

Bias goes to zero

#### For fixed sample count N

$$\lambda(x) = Np(x)$$

$$\hat{I} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=1}^{N} \frac{f(x_k)}{p(x_k)}$$

Monte Carlo estimator is unbiased

Ι

 $Var[\hat{I}] =$ 

 $\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}] = \int_{V}$ 

$$\int_{V} \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] - \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^2$$

 $\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k)$ 

$$Var[\hat{I}] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] - \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^2$$
$$\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^2 = \left(\int_V w(x)f(x)\lambda(x)dx\right)^2$$
$$\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] = \mathbb{E}\left[\sum_{j \neq k} w(x_j)f(x_j)w(x_k)f(x_k) + \sum_k (w(x_k)f(x_k))^2\right]$$

 $\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k)$ 

$$Var[\hat{I}] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] - \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^2$$
$$\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^2 = \left(\int_V w(x)f(x)\lambda(x)dx\right)^2$$
$$\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] = \mathbb{E}\left[\sum_{j \neq k} w(x_j)f(x_j)w(x_k)f(x_k) + \sum_k (w(x_k)f(x_k))^2\right]$$

 $\hat{I} = \sum_{k=1}^{N} w_k(x_k) f(x_k)$ 

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] -$ 



 $\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] = \int_{V \times V} w(x) f(x) w(y) f(y)$ Using Campbell's Theorem

$$Var[\hat{I}] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] - \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^2$$
$$\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^2 = \left(\int_V w(x)f(x)\lambda(x)dx\right)^2$$
$$w(x_j)f(x_j)w(x_k)f(x_k) = \mathbb{E}\left[\sum_k (w(x_k)f(x_k))^2\right]$$
$$f(x)w(y)f(y)\varrho(x,y)dxdy + \int_V (w(x)f(x))^2\lambda(x)dx$$

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] -$ 



 $\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] = \int_{V \times V} w(x) f(x) w(y) f(y)$ 

$$\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^{2}] - \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^{2}$$

$$\int_{V} w(x)f(x)\lambda(x)dx \right)^{2}$$

$$\Phi)\varrho(x,y)dxdy + \int_{V} (w(x)f(x))^{2}\lambda(x)dx$$

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] -$ 



 $\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] = \int_{V \times V} w(x) f(x) w(y) f(y)$ 

$$\mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] - \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^2$$

$$\int_V w(x)f(x)\lambda(x)dx \Big)^2$$

$$\Phi)\varrho(x,y)dxdy + \int_V (w(x)f(x))^2\lambda(x)dx$$

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{V \times V} w(x)f(x)w(y)f(y)\varrho(x,y)dxdy + \int_{V} (w(x)f(x))^2\lambda(x)dx$ 

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}^2] - \mathbb{E}[\hat{I}]^2$ 

$$-\left(\int_{V} w(x)f(x)\lambda(x)dx\right)^2$$

$$w(x) = 1/\lambda(x)$$

$$-\left(\int_{V} w(x)f(x)\lambda(x)dx\right)^2$$



 $w(x) = 1/\lambda(x)$ 

 $-\left(\int_{V} w(x)f(x)\lambda(x)dx\right)^{2}$ 

For an unbiased Monte Carlo Estimator



 $w(x) = 1/\lambda(x)$ 

# $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{V \times V} w(x)f(x)w(y)f(y)\varrho(x,y)dxdy + \int_{V} (w(x)f(x))^2\lambda(x)dx$

 $- \left( \int_V f(x) dx \right)$ 

For an unbiased Monte Carlo Estimator



 $w(x) = 1/\lambda(x)$ 

# 

 $I^2$ 

For an unbiased Monte Carlo Estimator

 $w(x) = 1/\lambda(x)$ 

# $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{V \times V} w(x)f(x)w(y)f(y)\varrho(x,y)dxdy + \int_{V} (w(x)f(x))^2\lambda(x)dx - I^2$

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{V \times V} f(x)f(y)\frac{\varrho(x,y)}{\lambda(x)\lambda(y)}dx$ 

$$w(x) = 1/\lambda(x)$$
  
 $\frac{\partial y}{\partial (y)} dxdy + \int_V (w(x)f(x))^2\lambda(x)dx - I^2$ 

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{V \times V} f(x)f(y)\frac{\varrho(x,y)}{\lambda(x)\lambda(y)}dx$ 

$$w(x) = 1/\lambda(x)$$

$$\frac{y}{\lambda(y)}dxdy + \int_{V} (w(x)f(x))^{2}\lambda(x)dx - I^{2}$$

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{V \times V} f(x)f(y)\frac{\varrho(x,y)}{\lambda(x)\lambda(y)}dx$ 

$$dxdy \qquad + \int_V \frac{f(x)^2}{\lambda(x)} dx \qquad - I^2$$

For an unbiased Monte Carlo Estimator

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{V \times V} f(x)f(y) \frac{\varrho(x,y)}{\lambda(x)\lambda(y)} dx$ 

Second order correlation

$$dxdy + \int_{V} \frac{f(x)^{2}}{\lambda(x)} dx - I^{2}$$
Ins First order correlations

#### Variance only depends on the first and the second order correlations

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{V \times V} f(x)f(y)\frac{\varrho(x,y)}{\lambda(x)\lambda(y)}dxdy + \int_{V} \frac{f(x)^2}{\lambda(x)}dx = I^2$ 

## **Stationary Point Processes**



#### Stationary (translation invariant)

$$\lambda(x) = \lambda$$
 is a constant  $\varrho(x,y) = \lambda^2 g(x-y)$ 

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{V \times V} f(x)f(y)\frac{\varrho(x,y)}{\lambda(x)\lambda(y)}dxdy + \int_{V} \frac{f(x)^2}{\lambda(x)}dx = I^2$ 

#### $\lambda(x) = \lambda$

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{V \times V} f(x)f(y)\frac{\varrho(x,y)}{\lambda^2}dxdy + \int_{V} \frac{f(x)^2}{\lambda}dx = I^2$ 

#### $\lambda(x) = \lambda$

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda^2} \int_{V \times V} f(x)f(y)\varrho(x,y)dxdy + \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^2 dx - I^2$ 

 $\varrho(x,y) = \lambda^2 q(x-y)$ 



 $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda^2} \int_{V \times V} f(x)f(y)\lambda^2 g(x-y)dxdy + \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^2 dx - I^2$ 

 $\rho(x, y) = \lambda^2 g(x - y)$ 



Arrangements



**Poisson Processes** 



Clusters

 $\rho(x, y) = \lambda^2 q(x - y)$ 

#### Density $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda^2} \int_{V \times V} f(x)f(y)\lambda^2 g(x-y)dxdy + \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^2 dx - I^2$



Well distributed



h = x - y

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda^2} \int_{V \times V} f(x)f(y)\lambda^2 g(x-y)dxdy + \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^2 dx - I^2$ 

h = x - y

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda^2} \int_{V \times V} f(x) f(x-h) \lambda^2$ 

$$\Lambda^2 g(h) dx dh + \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_V f(x)^2 dx - I^2$$

h = x - y

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^2 dx + \frac{1}{\lambda^2} \int_{V \times V} f(x)f(x-h)\lambda^2 g(h) dx dh - I^2$ 

h = x - y

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^{2} dx + \int_{V} \int_{V} f(x)f(x-h)g(h) dx dh - I^{2}$ 

Autocorrelation:  $a_f(h) = \int f(x)f(x-h)dh$ 

h = x - y

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^{2} dx + \frac{1}{\lambda^{2}} \int_{V} a_{f}(h)g(h) dh$ 

 $- I^2$ 

# $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^2 dx + \frac{1}{\lambda^2} \int_{V} a_f(h)g(h)dh - I^2$



f(x, y)

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^2 dx + \frac{1}{\lambda^2} \int_{V} a_f(h)g(h)dh - I^2$ 

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^2 dx + \frac{1}{\lambda^2} \int_{V} a_f(h)g(h)dh - I^2$ 

#### Autocorrelation



f(x,y)

 $a_f(h)$ 

#### Autocorrelation



f(x,y)

 $a_f(h)$ 

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^2 dx + \frac{1}{\lambda^2} \int_{V} a_f(h)g(h)dh - I^2$ 



g(h)

#### Autocorrelation



f(x,y)

 $a_f(h)$ 

 $Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^2 dx + \frac{1}{\lambda^2} \int_{V} a_f(h)g(h)dh - I^2$ 



g(h)

 $a_f(h)g(h)$ Oztireli [2016]

## **Uniform and Isotropic Jittered Samples**

Regular grid





## **Uniform and Isotropic Jittered Samples**

#### Circle light

#### Circle light



#### (a) Uniform jitter (b) Random jitter (c) Uniform jitter (d) Random jitter (RMS 6.59%) (RMS 8.32%) (RMS 13.4%) (RMS 10.4%)

#### Square light



#### Square light



Rammamoorthi et al.[2012]


## **Uniform and Isotropic Jittered Samples**

#### Reference

Random Jitter Uniform Jitter





#### (RMS 11.21%)





#### (RMS 10.92%)

**Isotropic Jitter** 

#### (RMS 10.79%)



(RMS 11.77%)

(RMS 8.77%)



#### • Error Formulation in the Spatial Domain

- Error Formulation in the Fourier Domain
- Practical Results
- Conclusion: Design Principles

## Variance for Stationary Point Processes

$$Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_{V} f(x)^2 dx -$$

 $\mathbb{E}\langle \mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\nu) \rangle$ 

$$\frac{1}{\lambda^2} \int_V a_f(h)g(h)dh - I^2$$

- **Relation between the Spatial and Fourier Statistics** 
  - $\mathcal{F}(a_f)(\nu) = \mathcal{P}_f(\nu)$ 
    - Power spectrum

$$\rangle \rangle = \lambda G(\nu) + 1$$

### Variance for Stationary Point Processes

$$\begin{array}{ll} \mbox{Spatial} \\ \mbox{Formulation} \end{array} & Var[\hat{I}] = \frac{1}{\lambda} \int_V f(x)^2 dx \ - \end{array}$$

Fourier Formulation

$$\operatorname{Var}[\hat{I}] = \int_{\Omega} \mathbb{E} \langle \mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\nu) \rangle \mathcal{P}_f$$

 $-\frac{1}{\lambda^2}\int_{V}a_f(h)g(h)dh - I^2$ 

 $(\nu)d\nu - \mathcal{P}_f(0)$ 

 $\mathcal{F}(a_f)(\nu) = \mathcal{P}_f(\nu)$  Power spectrum

 $\mathbb{E}\langle \mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\nu)\rangle = \lambda G(\nu) + 1$ 



# Samples and function in Fourier Domain





▼ € ⊑



# Sampling in Primal Domain is Convolution in **Fourier Domain**



 $f(x) \mathbf{S}(x)$ 



#### Fredo Durand [2011]

# Sampling in Primal Domain is Convolution in **Fourier Domain**





## Aliasing in Reconstruction



▼ € ⊡



## Aliasing in Reconstruction



▼ € ⊡



# **Error in Monte Carlo Integration**





# Aliasing (Reconstruction) vs. Error (Integration)



#### 



### Monte Carlo Estimator







#### Fredo Durand [2011]

## Samples Power Spectrum



$$S_N(\vec{x}) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=1}^N \delta(\vec{x} - \vec{x}_k)$$

# $\hat{I} = \int_0^1 S_N(\vec{x}) f(\vec{x}) \, d\vec{x}$

#### Spectrum



$$\mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\nu) = \left| \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=1}^N e^{-i2\pi\nu \cdot \vec{x}_k} \right|^2$$

85

## Samples Power Spectrum



$$S_N(\vec{x}) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=1}^N \delta(\vec{x} - \vec{x_k})$$

# $\hat{I} = \int_0^1 S_N(\vec{x}) f(\vec{x}) \, d\vec{x}$



## Samples Power Spectrum



$$S_N(\vec{x}) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=1}^N \delta(\vec{x} - \vec{x}_k)$$

# $\hat{I} = \int_0^1 S_N(\vec{x}) f(\vec{x}) \, d\vec{x}$



### **Expected Sampling Power Spectra**



 $\hat{I} = \int_0^1 S_N(\vec{x}) f(\vec{x}) \, d\vec{x}$ 

Spectrum



$$\mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\nu) = \left| \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=1}^N e^{-i2\pi\nu \cdot \vec{x}_k} \right|^2$$

### **Expected Sampling Power Spectra**



 $\hat{I} = \int_0^1 S_N(\vec{x}) f(\vec{x}) \, d\vec{x}$ 



### **Expected Sampling Power Spectra**



 $\hat{I} = \int_0^1 S_N(\vec{x}) f(\vec{x}) \, d\vec{x}$ 

#### Expected Spectrum



$$\mathbb{E}\left[\mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\nu)\right] = \left[\left|\frac{1}{N}\sum_{k=1}^N e^{-i2\pi\nu\cdot\vec{x}_k}\right|^2\right]$$

 $\hat{I} = \int_0^1 S_N(\vec{x}) f(\vec{x}) d\vec{x} = \int_\Omega \mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu) \mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu) d\nu$ 

Using Convolution theorem

 $\hat{I} = \int_{\Omega} \mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu) \mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu) d\nu$ 

 $\hat{I} = \int_{\Omega} \mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu) \mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu) d\nu$ 

 $I = \int_{V} f(x) dx = \mathcal{F}_f(0)$ 

 $\hat{I} = \int_{\Omega} \mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu) \mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu) d\nu$ 



 $I = \int_{V} f(x) dx = \mathcal{F}_f(0)$ 

Error:  $\Delta = \hat{I} - I$ 

#### **Error: Bias Term**

Error: 
$$\Delta = \int_{\Omega} \mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\mathbf{r})$$
  
Bias:  $\mathbb{E}[\Delta] = \int_{\Omega} \mathbb{E}[\mathcal{F}_{S_N}]$ 

 $(\nu)\mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu)d\nu - \mathcal{F}_f(0)$ 

 $\mathcal{F}_{N}(\nu)]\mathcal{F}_{f}^{*}(\nu)d\nu - \mathcal{F}_{f}(0)$ 

$$\mathbb{E}[Xa] = \mathbb{E}[X] a$$
$$\mathbb{E}[a] = a$$



#### **Error: Bias Term**

Error: 
$$\Delta = \int_{\Omega} \mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu) \mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu) d\nu - \mathcal{F}_f(0)$$
  
Bias:  $\mathbb{E}[\Delta] = \int_{\Omega} \mathbb{E}[\mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu)] \mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu) d\nu - \mathcal{F}_f(0)$ 

$$\mathbb{E}\left[\mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu)\right] = \delta(\nu) \qquad \text{Bias goes to zero}$$

w(x)

$$c) = 1/p(x)$$

Subr and Kautz [2013]

# Error: $\Delta = \int_{\Omega} \mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu) \mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu) d\nu - \mathcal{F}_f(0)$

Variance:  $Var[\Delta]$ 

Error: 
$$\Delta = \int_{\Omega} \mathcal{F}_{S_N}($$

Variance: 
$$Var[\Delta] = Var[\hat{I} - I]$$

 $(\nu)\mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu)d\nu - \mathcal{F}_f(0)$ 

Error: 
$$\Delta = \int_{\Omega} \mathcal{F}_{S_N}($$

#### Variance: $Var[\Delta] = Var[\hat{I} - I] = Var[\hat{I}] - Var[I]$

#### $(\nu)\mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu)d\nu - \mathcal{F}_f(0)$

Error: 
$$\Delta = \int_{\Omega} \mathcal{F}_{S_N}($$

#### Variance: $Var[\Delta] = Var[\hat{I} - I] = Var[\hat{I}] - Var[I] = Var[\hat{I}]$

#### $(\nu)\mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu)d\nu - \mathcal{F}_f(0)$

Error: 
$$\Delta = \int_{\Omega} \mathcal{F}_{S_N}($$

Variance:

 $Var[\Delta] = Var[\hat{I}]$ 

 $(\nu)\mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu)d\nu - \mathcal{F}_f(0)$ 

#### $Var[\Delta] = Var[\hat{I}]$

# Error: $\Delta = \int_{\Omega} \mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu) \mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu) d\nu - \mathcal{F}_f(0)$

Variance: 
$$Var[\Delta] = \int_{\Omega} Var[\mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu)]$$

#### $\mathcal{F}_{f}(\nu)\mathcal{F}_{f}(\nu)d\nu - Var[\mathcal{F}_{f}(0)]$

 $Var[Xa] = Var[X] a^*a$ 



#### $Var[\Delta] = Var[\hat{I}]$

# Error: $\Delta = \int_{\Omega} \mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu) \mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu) d\nu - \mathcal{F}_f(0)$

Variance: 
$$Var[\Delta] = \int_{\Omega} Var[\mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu)]$$

#### $\mathcal{F}_{f}(\nu)\mathcal{F}_{f}(\nu)d\nu - Var[\mathcal{F}_{f}(0)]$

 $Var[Xa] = Var[X] a^*a$ 



# Variance: $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{\Omega} Var[\mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu)] \mathcal{F}_f^*(\nu) \mathcal{F}_f(\nu) d\nu$

# Variance: $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{\Omega} Var[\mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu)] \mathcal{F}_f(\nu) \mathcal{F}_f(\nu) d\nu$ $= \int_{\Omega} Var[\mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu)] \mathcal{P}_f(\nu) d\nu$

# Variance: $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{\Omega} Var[\mathcal{F}_{S_N}(\nu)] \mathcal{P}_f(\nu) d\nu$

$$= \int_{\Omega/0} \mathbb{E} \left[ \mathcal{P} \right]$$

 $\mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\nu) ] \mathcal{P}_f(\nu) d\nu$ 

#### Variance of Monte Carlo Integration in Fourier Domain



### Variance of Monte Carlo Estimator

 $\mathbb{E}ig[\mathcal{P}_{S_N}(
u)ig]$ 



 $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{\Omega/0}$ 



 $\mathcal{P}_f(\nu)$ 



 $d\nu$ 

#### Fredo Durand [2011] Subr & Kautz [2013] Pilleboue et al. [2015]





X






$$Var[\hat{I}] = \int_0^\infty \rho^{d-1} \int_{\mathcal{S}^{d-1}}$$



 $\mathbb{E}\left[\tilde{\mathcal{P}}_{S_N}(
ho\mathbf{n})
ight]$ 

Х

 $\mathcal{P}_f(
ho \mathbf{n})$ 



#### $d\mathbf{n} d\rho$



 $ilde{\mathcal{P}}_{{S}_N}\!(
ho)$ 







 $\tilde{\mathcal{P}}_{S_N}(\rho)$ 













 $\tilde{\mathcal{P}}_{S_N}(\rho)$ 







 $ilde{\mathcal{P}}_{{S}_N}(
ho)$ 

$$Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{0}^{\infty} \rho^{d-1}$$

Samplers	Worst Case	Best Case
Random	$\mathcal{O}(N^{-1})$	$\mathcal{O}(N^{-1})$
Poisson Disk	$\mathcal{O}(N^{-1})$	$\mathcal{O}(N^{-1})$
CCVT	$\mathcal{O}(N^{-1.5})$	$\mathcal{O}(N^{-3})$







### Variance: Product of Power Spectra



Sampling Power Spectrum

### Variance: Product of Power Spectra



Sampling Power Spectrum

### Variance: Product of Power Spectra





Sampling Power Spectrum

### Jitter vs Poisson Disk Radial Power Spectra





118

### Jitter vs Poisson Disk Radial Power Spectra



 $ilde{\mathcal{P}}_{{S}_N}\!(
ho)$ 

$$Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{0}^{\infty} \rho^{d-1}$$

Samplers	Worst Case	Best Case
Random	$\mathcal{O}(N^{-1})$	$\mathcal{O}(N^{-1})$
Poisson Disk	$\mathcal{O}(N^{-1})$	$\mathcal{O}(N^{-1})$
CCVT	$\mathcal{O}(N^{-1.5})$	$\mathcal{O}(N^{-3})$





#### Isotropic Spectrum Poisson Disk

Pilleboue et al. [







Slide after Wojciech Jarosz





#### Initialize



#### Shuffle rows



#### Shuffle columns











#### N-rooks / Latin Hypercube

N-rooks Spectrum







#### N-rooks / Latin Hypercube

Spectrum





#### N-rooks / Latin Hypercube

N-rooks Spectrum





#### N-rooks / Latin Hypercube

N-rooks Spectrum





Jitter

Jitter Spectrum



#### N-rooks / Latin Hypercube

N-rooks Spectrum





Multi-Jitter

Multi-Jitter Spectrum

Chiu et al. [1993]





#### N-rooks / Latin Hypercube

N-rooks Spectrum



#### Multi-jitter

Multi-Jitter Spectrum

Chiu et al. [1993]





#### N-rooks / Latin Hypercube

N-rooks Spectrum



#### Multi-jitter

Multi-Jitter Spectrum

Chiu et al. [1993]

# Sampling in Higher Dimensions

# 4D Sampling



2D 2D  $(u_1, v_1)$  $(x_1, y_1)$  $(u_2, v_2)$  $(x_2, y_2)$  $(u_3, v_3)$  $(x_3, y_3)$  $(u_4, v_4)$  $(x_4, y_4)$ 4D  $(x_1, y_1, u_3, v_3)$  $(x_2, y_2, u_1, v_1)$  $(x_3, y_3, u_4, v_4)$  $(x_4, y_4, u_2, v_2)$ 

# 4D Sampling



2D 2D  $(u_1, v_1)$  $(x_1, y_1)$  $(u_2, v_2)$  $(x_2, y_2)$  $(u_3, v_3)$  $(x_3, y_3)$  $(u_4, v_4)$  $(x_4, y_4)$ 4D  $(x_1, y_1, u_3, v_3)$  $(x_2, y_2, u_1, v_1)$  $(x_3, y_3, u_4, v_4)$  $(x_4, y_4, u_2, v_2)$ 

# 4D Sampling



2D 2D  $(u_1, v_1)$  $(x_1, y_1)$  $(u_2, v_2)$  $[x_2, y_2]$  $(u_3, v_3)$  $(x_3, y_3)$  $(u_4, v_4)$  $(x_4, y_4)$ 4D  $(x_1, y_1, u_3, v_3)$  $(x_2, y_2, u_1, v_1)$  $(x_3, y_3, u_4, v_4)$  $(x_4, y_4, u_2, v_2)$ 

138

### 4D Sampling Spectra along Projections





### 4D Sampling Spectra along Projections



140

### 4D Sampling Spectra along Projections



How can we perform Convergence Analysis for Anisotropic Sampling Spectra ?

### Variance Formulation for Anisotropic Sampling Spectra

 $\mathbb{E}ig[\mathcal{P}_{S_N}(
u)ig]$ 





#### N-rooks spectrum



N-rooks



 $\mathcal{P}_f(\nu)$ 



d
u

# Integrand spectrum $f(\vec{x})$



X

### Variance Formulation for Anisotropic Sampling Spectra



 $d\mathbf{n} d\rho$
$\mathbb{E}\left[ ilde{\mathcal{P}}_{S_N}(
ho \mathbf{n})
ight]$  $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{\mathcal{S}^{d-1}} \int_{0}^{\infty} \rho^{d-1}$ 



 $\mathbb{E}\left[\mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\rho_k \mathbf{n_k})\right]$  $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{\mathcal{S}^{d-1}} \int_{0}^{\infty} \rho^{d-1} - \frac{1}{\rho} \int_{0}^{\infty} \rho^{d-1} - \frac{1}{\rho} \int_{0}^{\infty} \rho^{d-1} \rho^{d-1} \rho^{d-1} - \frac{1}{\rho} \int_{0}^{\infty} \rho^{d-1} \rho^{d-1} \rho^{d-1} - \frac{1}{\rho} \int_{0}^{\infty} \rho^{d-1} \rho^{d-1} \rho^{d-1} \rho^{d-1} - \frac{1}{\rho} \int_{0}^{\infty} \rho^{d-1} \rho^{d-1}$ 



 $Var[\hat{I}] = \int_{\mathcal{S}^{d-1}} \int_{0}^{\infty} d^{-1}$ 



 $\times$ 



 $d\rho d\mathbf{n}$ 



 $\mathbf{n}_k$ 

$$Var[\hat{I}] = \lim_{m \to \infty} \sum_{k=1}^{m} \int_{0}^{\infty} \rho^{d-1} \mathbb{E}\left[\mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\rho^{d-1})\right] \mathbb{E}$$

### $(\rho_k \mathbf{n_k})$ ] × $\mathcal{P}_f(\rho_k \mathbf{n_k})$ $d\rho \Delta \mathbf{n_k}$

$$Var[\hat{I}] = \lim_{m \to \infty} \sum_{k=1}^{m} \int_{0}^{\infty} \rho^{d-1}$$

### $-1 \mathbb{E}\left[\mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\rho_k \mathbf{n}_k)\right] \mathcal{P}_f(\rho_k \mathbf{n}_k) d\rho \Delta \mathbf{n}_k$







# Power Spectrum





Power

Power



# Power Spectrum





Power

Power



#### Variance due to N-rooks Sampler $f(\vec{x})$



 $\left< \mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\nu) \right>$ 

![](_page_153_Picture_3.jpeg)

N-rooks spectrum

$$\mathcal{P}_f(\nu)$$

![](_page_153_Figure_9.jpeg)

#### Variance due to N-rooks Sampler $f(\vec{x})$

![](_page_154_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_154_Picture_2.jpeg)

![](_page_154_Picture_3.jpeg)

Var

![](_page_154_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_154_Picture_6.jpeg)

N-rooks spectrum

![](_page_154_Picture_9.jpeg)

![](_page_154_Picture_10.jpeg)

 $\mathcal{P}_f(
u)$ 

![](_page_154_Picture_12.jpeg)

# d u

#### Integrand spectrum

![](_page_154_Picture_15.jpeg)

Integrand spectrum

![](_page_154_Picture_17.jpeg)

 $d\nu$ 

155

![](_page_154_Figure_20.jpeg)

![](_page_154_Figure_21.jpeg)

### Variance Convergence of Latin Hypercube (N-rooks)

![](_page_155_Figure_1.jpeg)

#### Pixel B

### Non-Axis Aligned Integrand Spectra

 $\mathcal{P}_f(
u)$ 

![](_page_156_Picture_2.jpeg)

![](_page_156_Picture_5.jpeg)

### **Non-Axis Aligned Integrand Spectra**

![](_page_157_Figure_1.jpeg)

![](_page_157_Picture_2.jpeg)

#### Multi-jittered Samples

![](_page_157_Picture_5.jpeg)

 $\left\langle \mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\nu) \right\rangle$ 

![](_page_157_Picture_7.jpeg)

 $\mathcal{P}_f(\nu)$ 

![](_page_157_Picture_9.jpeg)

#### Sampling Spectrum

![](_page_157_Picture_13.jpeg)

### **Shearing Multi-Jittered Samples**

![](_page_158_Figure_1.jpeg)

#### Sheared Samples

 $\left\langle \mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\nu) \right\rangle$ 

 $\mathcal{P}_f(\nu)$ 

![](_page_158_Picture_6.jpeg)

#### Sheared Spectrum

![](_page_158_Picture_10.jpeg)

### How can we determine the sample shearing parameters ?

![](_page_159_Figure_1.jpeg)

#### Sheared Samples

 $\left\langle \mathcal{P}_{S_N}(\nu) \right\rangle$ 

![](_page_159_Picture_4.jpeg)

![](_page_159_Picture_5.jpeg)

#### Sheared Spectrum

![](_page_159_Picture_9.jpeg)

![](_page_159_Picture_10.jpeg)

### Frequency Analysis of Light Transport

### **Related Work**

- Frequency Analysis of Light Transport Durand et al. [2005]
- Depth of Field Soler et al. [2009]
- Motion Blur Egan et al. [2009]
- Ambient Occlusion Egan et al. [2011] and more...

### **Related Work**

- Frequency Analysis of Light Transport Durand et al. [2005]
- Depth of Field Soler et al. [2009]
- Motion Blur Egan et al. [2009]
- Ambient Occlusion Egan et al. [2011] and more...

### **Related Work**

- Frequency Analysis of Light Transport Durand et al. [2005]
- Depth of Field Soler et al. [2009]
- Motion Blur Egan et al. [2009]

### Reconstruction

• Ambient Occlusion Egan et al. [2011] and more...

![](_page_163_Picture_6.jpeg)

### Integration

![](_page_164_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_165_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_165_Picture_2.jpeg)

![](_page_166_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_166_Picture_2.jpeg)

#### focal plane / virtual image plane

![](_page_167_Picture_2.jpeg)

![](_page_167_Picture_3.jpeg)

#### 1D Aperture

U

![](_page_167_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_167_Picture_6.jpeg)

#### focal plane / virtual image plane

![](_page_168_Picture_2.jpeg)

![](_page_168_Picture_3.jpeg)

![](_page_168_Picture_4.jpeg)

![](_page_168_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_169_Figure_1.jpeg)

#### XU Slices

![](_page_169_Picture_4.jpeg)

![](_page_169_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_170_Figure_1.jpeg)

![](_page_170_Picture_3.jpeg)

![](_page_170_Picture_4.jpeg)

### **Depth of Field Analysis** Ray space

### Spatial

#### Fourier

![](_page_171_Picture_3.jpeg)

# XU Slices

![](_page_171_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_171_Picture_6.jpeg)

### **Depth of Field Analysis** Ray space

### Spatial

#### Fourier

![](_page_172_Picture_3.jpeg)

## XU Slices

![](_page_172_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_172_Picture_6.jpeg)

![](_page_173_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### X XU Slices

![](_page_173_Picture_2.jpeg)

### Light Field gets Sheared

# $x = x + u \frac{F - d}{d}$ , F: focal distance Shear increases with b febted by the feature of the

![](_page_174_Picture_2.jpeg)

![](_page_174_Picture_4.jpeg)

![](_page_174_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_174_Picture_6.jpeg)

![](_page_174_Picture_8.jpeg)

### **Spectra along Different Projections**

Uncorrelated Multi-jittered

![](_page_175_Picture_2.jpeg)

![](_page_175_Picture_3.jpeg)

Integrand

![](_page_175_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_175_Picture_6.jpeg)

![](_page_175_Picture_7.jpeg)

![](_page_175_Picture_8.jpeg)

![](_page_175_Picture_9.jpeg)

![](_page_175_Picture_10.jpeg)

### **Spectra along Different Projections**

#### XU

Uncorrelated Multi-jittered

ntegrand

![](_page_176_Picture_3.jpeg)

![](_page_176_Picture_4.jpeg)

![](_page_176_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_176_Picture_6.jpeg)

### **Spectra along Different Projections**

Uncorrelated Multi-jittered

ntegrand

![](_page_177_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_177_Picture_3.jpeg)

![](_page_177_Picture_4.jpeg)

![](_page_177_Picture_5.jpeg)

- Error Formulation in the Spatial Domain
- Error Formulation in the Fourier Domain
- Practical Results
- Conclusion: Design Principles

### Variance Analysis of Jittered Strategies

Square Light Sources Circle sian Gaus

Reference

![](_page_179_Picture_2.jpeg)

Samplers








Samplers







### Samplers





### Samplers

Uniform J **R-Uniform J** Isotropic J







# **Convergence Analysis of Jittered Strategies**



Iog RMSE gol





## **Original Uncorrelated-MultiJittered Samples**

## **XU** Projection





186











## **Original Uncorrelated Multi-jittered Samples**

### XU Subspace











# Variance Heatmap

## With Original Samples



Uncorrelated Multi-jittered

## Multiple images



# Variance Heatmap

## With Original Samples



Uncorrelated Multi-jittered

### With Sheared Samples



- Error Formulation in the Spatial Domain
- Error Formulation in the Fourier Domain
- Practical Results
- Conclusion: Design Principles

## **Challenging Cases: XU & YV Projections**



### Hairline Anisotropy



## Sampling XU Spectrum

## Pixel A XU Spectrum

## **Oracle Accuracy**





### Pixel B Sampling XU Spectrum XU Spectrum

## **Double-wedge Spectrum**

## **Design Principles for New Sampling Patterns** Multi-Jittered Spectra Desired Sampling Spectra



### Singh and Jarosz [2017]





### **Design Principles for New Sampling Patterns** Multi-Jittered Spectra Desired Sampling Spectra













## Correlated Multi-Jitter





**Kensler** [2013]



# **Design Principles for New Sampling Patterns**

## Integrand Spectrum



## In both XU and YV Projections

## Desired Sampling Spectra



### Singh and Jarosz [2017]

196

# Summary



## Point processes to understand error in integration

 $\frac{1}{n^2} \sum_{i=1}^n n \int s_i^2(\mathbf{x}) d\mathbf{x}$ 

## **Closed-form** formulas amenable to **analysis**

## Only 1st & 2nd order statistics needed

# **Future Directions**



General domains & **local** scene analysis



## **Anti-aliasing & reconstruction**

## Sampling patterns with adaptive density & correlations